

**MICHAEL A. SANTO, P.C.**  
**Attorney at Law**  
**3047 Lee Place**  
**Bellmore, New York 11710-5035**  
**PH: 516.551.5503**  
**FAX: 888.501.9612**  
[attySANTO@gmail.com](mailto:attySANTO@gmail.com)

Of Counsel to:  
Silberstein Awad & Miklos, P.C.  
600 Old Country Road  
Garden City NY 11530

Admitted to Practice Law in:  
New York  
New Jersey  
Massachusetts

September 10, 2020

**RE: HOW TO ADDRESS ISSUES AS TO ELIMINATING COLUMBUS DAY**

Dear America:

Get it right. You have been faced with the decision to remove a simple holiday that has existed for more than 130 years. The act itself is uncomplicated; the state/city/town delegates the decision to a committee and they take a vote. The amount of time to remove the holiday is short and requires a one-page resolution. It can be eliminated and you never have to hear about it again, despite the number of years it was prominently celebrated in your municipality. You are the City of Pueblo, Colorado, Chicago, Illinois, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, Boston Massachusetts, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, Newark, New Jersey, Syracuse, New York, and so many cities and small communities around the nation.

You are swept up in a wave of what appears to be an indignant movement by citizens who are ill-informed—some believe to their heart, others hellbent on a false cause or narrative---wanting to “correct” history and erase deeds and acts of a gentleman named **Christofa Columbo**. Otherwise known as Columbus, this man changed history like no other. For more than 500 years he has been revered the world over. He is the positive symbol of hundreds of millions of Italians, and other immigrants around the world.

So, what is the point of not only removing Columbus Day, but swapping it out for another group’s day? Isn’t that spiteful? Doesn’t it go against the concepts and philosophies of “inclusiveness,” “diversity” and “co-existence”? Sounds like a bad lesson for our children, correct? How and why have you—with the fleeting power and control that you have for your term of office—been so quick to act without considering the FACTS? Have you considered for a moment that the current assertions and allegations against Columbus are wrong? Are you brave enough to review the bases for your own thoughts? Don’t you feel that it’s your obligation and duty to your constituents to study history, hear from the “other side” with an open mind before you vote? After all, the

holiday started in 1892 by Proclamation by President Harrison, and became a national holiday by Proclamation in 1937 by President Franklin D. Roosevelt.

Starting in about the 1980s, there was a movement to change the course of history by printing false accounts of Columbus, painting him in history books, classes, and popular charges as a murderer, rapist, and white supremacist. I don't want to explain the motives in such a short note, but you have a duty and obligation to search for the truth and find out.

### **Let's consider the purpose and origin of Columbus Day.**

To many historians, President Harrison's proclamation establishing Columbus Day was more about 1892 than about 1492. Consider the below.

Columbus Day actually evolved from a tragic and deadly episode in New Orleans, on March 14, 1891. Hundreds of thousands of Italian Immigrants had made their way to New Orleans in the 1880s in order to seek employment and leave an economically decimated southern Italy. The jobs were available due to the void of the freed slaves and the market for field workers. The immigrants arrived on the shores of the Mississippi River, settling into the current French Quarters (then named "Little Palermo").

On October 15, 1890, the New Orleans Police Commissioner David Hennessy was shot in front of his home; he died hours later in a nearby hospital. There were witnesses, but none could identify the possible four assassins. Nevertheless, and on the basis of the last whispers of Hennessy, who stated that the "Dagoes" did it, the police randomly rounded up hundreds of Italians on mere suspicion. Nineteen innocent Sicilian immigrants were falsely charged with his murder (FN 1: Articles on the lynching; the penultimate book on this topic is *Vendetta*, authored by Professor Richard Gambino).

The first trial involved nine defendants, resulting in the mistrial of three and a not guilty verdict as to six on March 12, 1891. Judge Baker, who presided over the trial remanded the nine back to the nearby Orleans Prison for new, unsubstantiated charges of "lying in wait with the intent to commit murder."

The city was in an uproar. The prosecutors employed underhanded tactics to gain advantage, jurors had been illegally contacted, and the Judge did everything to help convict these men, to no avail. Organizers had a plan.

On that fateful and despicable day, March 14, 1891, City organizers---including businessmen, politicians, and lawyers alike---arranged for a "meeting" by taking out ads in the local papers. People were invited to meet at a popular location not far from the prison, to **"remedy the failure of justice in the Hennessy case"** and were told to **"[c]ome prepared for action."** The organizers convinced the thousands who showed to march to the Orleans Prison, where they broke in, tracked down, and lynched 11

Italians. The brutal details are in the accounts in the footnote **[FN 1: Articles on the 1891 Lynching in New Orleans; 4: Victim Lists]**.

The account was printed around the nation and received with satisfaction and approval by such papers as the *New York Times*, the *Washington Post*, and the *San Francisco Chronicle*. The acceptance didn't stop there. Teddy Roosevelt, who was to become the Governor of New York a few years later, and eventually the 26<sup>th</sup> President of the United States, was quoted as saying that the horrific lynching was a "*rather good thing*." Suffice it to remark that the status of Italians at this time was low, hateful, and degrading, noting that such adjectives including "sub human," savages," and other distasteful names **[FN 5: NY Times Editorial: March 16, 1891; FN 6: An Open Letter to the NY Times, May 21, 2019]**.

The uproar from the trial, and the unscrupulous way that it was handled, became national and then international news. Italy pulled its Ambassador from the United States. Investigations into the account were a farce. The United States government intervened.

President Benjamin Harrison decided to use his office to acknowledge the contributions of Italians and Italian Americans with a Presidential Proclamation to honor a prominent Italian whose contributions were unquestioned; he selected Columbus. The first statue was placed at "The Circle," and named Columbus Circle in New York City, where it was unveiled on October 13, 1892.

The intention was for a "one-time" holiday, but given the strong and popular acclamation for an annual observance, it later became a national holiday **[FN 3: Articles Connecting the Lynching with the adoption of Columbus Day]**. Yet, there was another tragedy in America just a few short months before the New Orleans lynching, and it involved the Lakota Sioux (The Wounded Knee Massacre):

You won't find it in the public literature surrounding the first Columbus Day in 1892, but in the background lay two recent tragedies, one involving Native Americans, the other involving Italian Americans. The first tragedy was the massacre by U.S. troops of between 146 and 200 Lakota Sioux, including men, women and children, at Wounded Knee, South Dakota, on December 29, 1890. Shooting began after a misunderstanding involving an elderly, deaf Sioux warrior who hadn't heard and therefore did not understand that he was supposed to hand over his rifle to the U.S. Cavalry. The massacre at Wounded Knee marked the definitive end of Indian resistance in the Great Plains. The episode was immediately seen by the government as potentially troubling, although there was much popular sentiment against the Sioux. An inquiry was held, the soldiers were absolved, and some were awarded medals that Native Americans to this day are seeking to have rescinded.

See FN 3: *What Columbus Day Really Means*, AMERICAN SCHOLAR: October 4, 2012, by William J. Connell.

What's interesting, and discussed in the same above referenced article, is that Professor Connell poses the following with relation to these two tragedies and Columbus Day:

**Whenever I hear of protests about the Columbus Day holiday—protests that tend to pit Native Americans against Italian Americans, I remember these tragedies that occurred so soon before the first Columbus Day holiday, and I shake my head. President Harrison did not allude to either of these sad episodes in his proclamation of the holiday, but the idea for the holiday involved a vision of an America that would get beyond the prejudice that had led to these deaths. Columbus Day was supposed to recognize the greatness of all of America's people, but especially Italians and Native Americans.**

In a private message to this author via email on August 28, 2020, Professor Connell notes his current views on the above:

**I don't believe [President Harrison] specifically had Wounded Knee in mind when he proclaimed a Columbus Day in 1892...Instead there was a series of problems and crises, including Wounded Knee that he must have thought required healing. \*\*\*But Columbus Day was NOT created in reparations for the New Orleans episode...In 1892 there would have been no support for an "Italian" holiday. It was a national holiday that included Italians. \*\*\*Harrison was hoping to spread calm and to bring everybody together, both in the October 1892 celebration [of Columbus Day] and in the Chicago 1893 Exposition. Native Americans figured on both occasions as symbolic of the New and Old coming together. That was the idea behind Columbus Day...a national holiday, not the celebration of a single ethnicity. The idea was to bring together the many peoples here and to celebrate the land.**

President Benjamin Harrison's "PROCLAMATION 335—400<sup>TH</sup> Anniversary of the Discovery of America by Columbus" (FN 11), states in substance:

**[I, Benjamin Harrison, do hereby appoint Friday, October 21, 1892] as a general holiday for the people of the United States. On that day let the people, so far as possible, cease from toil and devote themselves to such exercises as may best express honor to the discoverer and their appreciation of the great achievements of the four completed centuries of American life.**

So, it seems fair to say that President Harrison's original thought and intention was maintained, but the association of a secular and broader view of "all peoples" transformed into a single ethnic celebration by Italian Americans.

In 1890 and 1891 both Italians and American Indians were victimized. Both suffered, and were horribly treated. Both were killed by American governments. Now, both sides are at odds over what Columbus Day means and who Columbus was. This historical context and the "evolution of the "day" adds a backdrop to and, I hope, an appreciation for what it means to be American.

President Harrison likely had another and very strong consideration for selecting Columbus and issuing the noted holiday: votes, particularly from Catholics. Columbus was an avid Catholic, who many perceived as one to seek out gold and riches in order to support his quest to regain Jerusalem.

At the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the United States was getting a makeover, with unprecedented waves of immigration from 1180 to 1910. The most numerous of these arrivals were Catholics. **(FN 14: ARTICLES CONNECTING COLUMBUS DAY WITH CATHOLICS: *Columbus Day: 1892, Not 1492*, Jack Schneider).**

Well before the 1892 proclamation, celebrations of Columbus were already on the calendar in St. Louis, Boston, Cincinnati, and New Orleans...[Harrison] was sanctioning the many celebrations already in place, according recognition to grassroots efforts by Catholics around the country. \*\*\*The proclamation had a political angle, too. Harrison was engaged in a battle for his political life. By formally recognizing Columbus, he sought to bring legions of new voters into the fold888an astute political appeal to the special-interest group-urban Catholics—whom he believed had the power to swing the election in his favor.

**FN 14.**

As one writer put it: “*Catholics needed a hero.*” **(FN 14: *Discovery this: Columbus isn’t about Columbus*, Sam Wineburg, L.A.Times, October 10, 2005).** As well, many in the Italian American community saw celebrating the life and accomplishments of Christopher Columbus as a way for them to be accepted by the mainstream. This extended to the Knights of Columbus, a Catholic fraternal benefit society founded in 1882. **[FN14: ARTICLES CONNECTING COLUMBUS DAY WITH CATHOLICS: *How Columbus Day Actually Became a Holiday*, Miranda Ashton, October 12, 2015].**

Thus, different historians and writers can point more to the practical considerations at the time of President’s Harrison’s proclamation:

1. The New Orleans lynching of March, 1891
2. The tragedy of Wounded Knee in December, 1890
3. The need for votes from Catholics
- 4.

No matter the explanation or intent, Columbus Day was meant to allow the American people to wholeheartedly celebrate our country’s historic past, and move into the future with harmony. But, strangely enough today’s standards of “inclusiveness,” “diversity,” and “co-existence,” seems to have been lost in the elimination of Columbus Day for another day, Indigenous Peoples’ Day. This trend has produced the same ill results that Americans have been trying to avoid, yet this spiteful act continues to gain momentum in our local school districts, towns, counties, cities, and states.

## **An Apology from NEW ORLEANS**

One Hundred Twenty-Eight years after the New Orleans lynching, and at the urging of the Italian American community, the brave Mayor of New Orleans, LaToya Cantrell, offered to issue a Proclamation and present a formal apology for the complicity of the then Mayor, and others, in 1891. She presented the apology before a battery of press officials, descendants of the victims and a large contingency of Italian Americans who came from around the country, at the American Italian Cultural Center in New Orleans **[FN 2: Press Accounts]**.

Mayor Cantrell's words and actions went a long way to help heal the societal wounds that has festered for all those years. **[FN 9: VIDEOS of "Apology"]**. Despite the length of time, the truth was revealed, an honest dialogue began, and this horrific piece of history can now be understood so that we can embrace the future on better terms. This was a lesson for us as to today's topic on Columbus.

## **Columbus Today**

What has come of Columbus? For nearly 500 years, our schools and his accounts remained in good stead. He was honored on an annual basis, not specifically as a great man, but as a favorable symbol for all Italian Americans who can now hold their heads high and say that we are part of the American success. Our culture and history have become one with Columbus. While there are so many Italians to emulate, be proud of and honor, it remains Columbus as the man who symbolized the break from the days when we were treated with disdain, called names, shunned from society and yes, lynched (there were other lynching of Italians in other communities, noting that New Orleans is the most tragic, not only because of the number, but the manner in which the city government was complicit).

What happened? In the 1980s, Columbus was, all of a sudden, no longer revered. He was labelled a slave trader, colonizer, and responsible for a number of atrocities involving the indigenous peoples he encountered on his trips here from Europe. Did the historians and academia get it wrong for 500 years? Did they miss something? No, not at all.

The dysfunction in the historical evaluation of Columbus started with a few unscrupulous and unsavory "researchers" who wrote new "false narratives" and whose mis-quotes from "primary sources" rattled a generation of teachers and students. The process called into question his character, methods and intentions, even to the point where people suggest that Columbus was a racist and white supremacist.

Do Italian Americans now have to defend what was correct for 500 years? Does this new false narrative now suggest that anything and everything Columbus have to come down, be hidden, and statues be removed to be placed into a warehouse?

ABSOLUTELY NOT...because these accusations are all FALSE. They must be debunked and, in fact, have been debunked.

Recently, I attended a mediation process set up by the Mayor of Pueblo, Colorado, between two groups representatives of local Italian Americans, and local indigenous and Latino peoples. The issue was what to do, if anything, with the Columbus Monument, which was erected in 1905 and placed on the National Register for Historic Places. As is the case in other cities such as Chicago, Philadelphia and Baltimore, Pueblo is experiencing continual protests at the site of the statue. The police force is stressed. The cost to keep peace is expensive.

The easy way out is to remove the “source” of the problem. But this is not surgery to remove cancer. This is a decision about being fair to the citizens of the city. What to do? Other cities simply take down Columbus statues in the middle of the night. There is really no thought there. They succumb to the loud voices of the minority, and, in many cases, outside agitators whose bizarre goals include disruption and chaos.

Pueblo Mayor Nick Gradisar set up the mediation process to hear both sides. Unfortunately, the process was sunk from the beginning. Why? Both sides showed up. The mediator was a professional and a Harvard Law graduate and handled the process in a sensible manner. Much time went into the process. What went wrong was the failure to learn and communicate.

When the groups were together for the first time in a room, references and quotes spewing the false narratives about Columbus (racist, murderer, white supremacist, colonizer, slave trader...) stopped any possible progress or communication. How could anything go on from there? It was impossible. The mediation ended and the decision now rests with the Pueblo City government, although there is hope of further talks. I truly hope that is the case, because communications are key. The underlying issue about the real Columbus is a festering sore.

The issue is this: Will those with the power and control to make the decision on the Columbus Monument actually take into account what I’ve just written? Will they side with the mob mentality, the false narratives, and the current bizarre trend called “CANCEL CULTURE.” If they do, then what is protected? What will last? Will history repeat itself at this level?

In other venues, the holiday was eliminated without much fanfare and in place of Indigenous Peoples’ Day, a day well deserved and an honor way past due. The Italian American community not only agrees with this concept the vast majority would volunteer to help it happen. The problem is that the current “movement” calls for a complete swap, noting that the day selected for Columbus Day has absolutely no meaning to Indigenous Peoples except to ensure that Columbus Day no longer exists.

There's something wrong here. Indigenous Peoples' day already exists on one or more other dates that have a real underlying meaning to this group. Why would this happen? The reason is strong, but based on "historical quick-sand."

My suggestion is really simple. Consider the facts. Read. Study.

### **False Narratives Must be Understood and Rejected**

I encourage America to ***get it right***. [ See FN 7: **Columbus: Academic Articles/Authors to Read**; See FN 8: **Campaigns in Favor of Columbus**]. See and read how these false narratives have been debunked, and how the basis and reliance for the negativism over Columbus is really about JUNK HISTORY. Before any politician exercises his or her power and control---especially over a long-standing symbol of greatness---one has the duty and obligation to see and understand history and the facts.

Additionally, consider going through the above referenced material. I maintain that the articles, books and wirings will confirm the notes below:

- **Columbus' main reason for the voyage was religious**, i.e. to spread Christianity (See FN 7: Author Carol Delaney: *Columbus and the Quest for Jerusalem: How Religion Drove the Voyages that led to America*. The author notes that the main goal of the voyage was to meet the Grand Khan of Chica in order to set up a trading post, the profits of which were to be used to finance a crusade to take back Jerusalem back from the Muslims.
- **Columbus was:**
  - **Not racist**. See FN 7: Rafael, *Columbus: THE HERO*, at Chapter 13. The author notes that Columbus wrote highly of the "natives," specifically making kind remarks and observations; however, he did note that there were differences. In other words, some tribes were kind, others were warlike, and others were "wild in all respects," including those which practiced cannibalism.
  - **Not a cannibal**. See FN 7: Rafael, *Columbus: THE HERO*, at Chapter 15.
  - **Not a slave-trader/holder**. See FN 7: Rafael, *Columbus: THE HERO*, at Chapter 22. It is clear in history that slavery was common and practiced in the Americas (and the "Old World") before Columbus arrived, that it existed from the remotest antiquity even to present. Queen Isabel was against slavery, allowing Columbus to enslave only native enemy combatants and criminals, which was a help to most of the native tribes by the way.



- **Not a torturer who cut off the hands of the locals.** See FN 7: Rafael, *Columbus: THE HERO, at Chapter 19*. There were instances of “wayward” Spaniards, who in disobedience of Columbus’ orders, did not maintain the peace and instead went on to steal and inflict injuries to natives. Clearly not a directive of Columbus, these acts are associated with Columbus simply because he was there. As the presence of Spaniards grew, Columbus’ control became weaker.
- **Not a murderer** See FN 7: Rafael, *Columbus: THE HERO, at Chapter 18, 28*. There’s a complete lack of understanding in terms of Columbus having complete control over Governor Ovando, for example, who was later replaced by Spanish Kings. Columbus was cleared of all such charges.
- **Not interested in making “servants” of the indigenous peoples** See FN 7: Rafael, *Columbus: THE HERO, at Chapter 11*
  - The most used “quote” and likely the most ignorant of quotes attributable to Columbus was the following:
    - *They were well-built with good bodies and handsome features...they do not bear arms...they have no iron. Their spears are made of cane...**They would make fine servants...with 50 men, we could subjugate them and make them do whatever we want.***
  - First, Columbus never looked down on the Indians. In fact, he praised the Indians for their culture.
  - Second, the quote was taken out of context (a painful and repetitive act by author Howard Zinn and others, and debunked by a myriad of respected historians and researchers (pages 63-66).
  - Third, the portion of the quote (“with fifty men we could subjugate them”) is not even part of the original paragraph, noting that that statement was made three days later from the first, and a reference to Queen Isabel that **IF** he had to fight them all he would need is 50 men...and that never happen. It’s important to know that Queen Isabel was against slavery.
  - See also FN: 7, Dr. Mary Grabar: *Debunking Howard Zinn: Exposing the Fake History that Turned a Generation Against America*, August, 2019 (See further: <https://marygrabar.com/>).

There is no doubt that Columbus behaved according to the tenets of the time. He did “take” some indigenous peoples with him, but not as slaves. His motive was to teach them Christianity and offer them a better life. But these acts do not fit into the bent narrative of the revisionists such as Howard Zinn, James Loewen, Ward Churchill, and several other lesser knowns who repeated the same unfounded script.

Author Mary Grabar studied the above radicals very closely and choose the one who had the biggest impact: Howard Zinn. Mr. Zinn was a fanatical anarchist, whose book, *A People’s History of the United States*, was the genesis for everything that is anti-

America. An admirer of Stalin, Mao, and anything communist, Zinn seemingly went out of his way to fabricate, manipulate and present a false narrative of American history, including the life of Columbus.

Professor Graybar provides a comprehensive critique of Howard Zinn's works, which are filled with mistakes, lies, half-truths, and unfounded smears. Reasonable people, and at my behest and invitation here, you should be in her debt for calling Zinn out and providing a powerful, and timely take-down of this pseudo-culture. She reveals how Zinn's shocking tales of severed hands, raped women and a lust for gold are all unfounded. His narrative about a genocidal Columbus captured the minds of the educational system and popular culture **[Also, See FN 13: Debunking "Top 5 Atrocities committed by Christopher Columbus"]**

Oddly enough, these same horrible allegations actually existed amount the hundreds or thousands of tribes occupying North and South America, as explained in the fine work of Charles Mann's books, *1491: New Reevaluations of the Americas Before Columbus* and *1493: Uncovering the New World Columbus Created*. It's clear that while some tribes were docile and peaceful, others were war-like and yes, "colonized" other tribal lands, and the tribes itself. Laying at the feet of Columbus the entire blame for the European colonization of the Americas is disingenuous and completely untrue. Sure, Leif Ericson "found" North America (for the his European country) many years before Columbus landed in the Caribbean, but Columbus is receiving the blame for all the bad things that happen after 1492 because he was the "first" from a Euro-Centric perspective.

Zinn's and the other works of fiction laid out a foundation for the violent, Marxist-inspired group ANTIFA, which declared a nationwide "Deface Columbus Day." The transformation of this radial group, and those who profess an alliance to them, set up causes to replace or eliminate Columbus Day, oftentimes being swapped out with Indigenous Peoples' Day.

Italian Americans have always stood with and for the Indigenous Peoples, with the full understanding about what and how they were decimated over a long period of time. I honestly don't believe that there is so much a gripe with Italian Americans by the Indigenous groups, rather than a sentiment that Columbus---as transformed over time with false narratives---became the face of evil and everything that was wrong from 1492 forward. But, their engagement with the elimination of Columbus Day and Columbus statues seemingly placates that overwhelming sense of victimhood. That's sad because both groups shared that victimhood status and there was never the animosity or ill will between the groups until lately. Italian Americans wish to end that. The best way to do that is with an understanding of the past, a willingness to cooperate and a desire to embrace each other moving forward. There's still room for that.

The list of false narratives, misrepresentations and fake history by the above list of men is not new. Whatever their goals, they have been studied, ridiculed and proven to be wrong by the legitimate and knowledgeable experts in the field of history. The problem

is that their narratives linger in the minds of students who were subjugated to and indoctrinated by their works at high school and college levels.

This need not happen here. It should not happen here. As politicians, you owe a duty and obligation to do what is right and best for the people in your community. No matter how large or small your municipality, your decisions will have significant impacts. Do you truly believe that you should act on the whims and representations of the few, without hearing from the “other side”? No, of course not.

That’s why I have taken the time to prepare and present this letter with the historical details on Columbus Day, the importance of that day to Americans in general, and to Italians, in particular. Fanatics rewrite history to edit out the points of history they don’t like. It’s an act of historic cleaning. Our country should not be walking down that road.

### **Summary**

The silent majority is complicit in their complacency. I grant you that. Italian Americans have become successful. That success made us lazy. Not anymore. If there’s one lesson here, is it that we are awake, we vote, and we will not stand for what we see is a multitude of civil rights violations taking place in our cities and communities.

It is a big mistake, and a dangerous precedent, to remove one statue of Columbus. Its tantamount to hysteria, a surrender to mob mentality and an exercise in ignorance. Which statue is next?

As restoration to “normalcy” is already happening. The Republican National Committee’s Resolution Committee recently adopted a **RESOLUTION TO CONSERVE HISTORY AND COMBAT PREJUDICE---CHRISTOPHER COLUMBUS**, in which the documents specifically recognize the following:

- Columbus’ contributions and courage
- Support the celebration of his unparalleled importance for Americans facing anti-Italian and anti-Catholic prejudice
- Affirms the need to take a strong position in support of our founding ideas in solidarity...by defending Columbus Day as a federal holiday.

### **FN 10: RNC RESOLUTION**

I have every reason to believe that the Democratic National Convention will issue a similar Resolution soon.

I’ve presented this letter in a format and offered an extensive and deep footnote section on purpose. I want you to have the ability to click to the sites in order to afford you the quick ability to learn and research before you make a decision because I WANT AMERICA TO GET IT RIGHT.

Most Sincerely,

*Michael A. Santo*

Michael A. Santo

***Volunteer Counsel: National Columbus Educational Foundation (NCEF)***

***Member: Columbus Citizens Foundation (CCF)***

***Member: Italian Sons and Daughters of America (ISDA)***

***Former General Counsel: NY State Order Sons & Daughters of Italy in America (OSDIA)***

***Former Special Counsel: NY State Commission for Social Justice, OSDIA***

## FOOTNOTES

### 1. ARTICLES ON THE LYNCHING

<http://garysreflections.blogspot.com/2017/01/a-mass-lynching-forgotten-in-american.html>

<https://www.globalresearch.ca/the-new-orleans-eleven-the-untold-history-of-the-lynching-of-italians-in-america/5372379>

[https://www.buzzfeed.com/adamserwer/how-an-1891-mass-lynching-tried-to-make-america-great-again?utm\\_term=.oggJxLRWb#.iw3wNbW9Q](https://www.buzzfeed.com/adamserwer/how-an-1891-mass-lynching-tried-to-make-america-great-again?utm_term=.oggJxLRWb#.iw3wNbW9Q)

<https://www.history.com/news/the-grisly-story-of-americas-largest-lynching>

[https://admin.americanthinker.com/articles/2017/08/when\\_will\\_new\\_orleans\\_apologize\\_for\\_the\\_italian\\_lynchings.html](https://admin.americanthinker.com/articles/2017/08/when_will_new_orleans_apologize_for_the_italian_lynchings.html)

<https://legallegacy.wordpress.com/2016/03/14/march-14-1891-lynching-of-eleven-italian-americans-in-new-orleans/>

### 2. NOLA PROJECT: PRESS ACCOUNTS

INCOMPLETE LIST OF MEDIA COVERAGE AS TO NOLA PROJECT: INCOMPLETE LIST OF MEDIA COVERAGE AS TO NOLA PROJECT:

New Orleans: April 12, 2019

[https://www.nola.com/news/article\\_ebd61396-a013-5b22-8171-bd8bd7416a88.html](https://www.nola.com/news/article_ebd61396-a013-5b22-8171-bd8bd7416a88.html)

NOLA.COM

<https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-47767421> BBC

<https://www.cnn.com/2019/04/01/us/new-orleans-mayor-apologizes-italian-americans-trnd/index.html>

CNN

<https://www.smithsonianmag.com/smart-news/new-orleans-apologizes-1891-lynching-italian-americans-180971959/> SMITHSONIAN MAGAZINE

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/nation/2019/04/01/new-orleans-apologize-lynching-italians-among-worst-american-history/> WASHINGTON POST

<https://thehill.com/homenews/state-watch/436702-new-orleans-mayor-to-apologize-to-italian-americans-for-1891-lynchings> THE HILL

<https://www.wsj.com/articles/an-overdue-apology-to-italian-americans-11554761121> WALL STREET JOURNAL

<https://www.cbc.ca/radio/asithappens/as-it-happens-friday-edition-1.5095791/it-s-never-too-late-new-orleans-mayor-apologizes-for-1891-mass-lynching-of-italian-americans-1.5095802> CANADIAN BROADCASTING

<https://www.fox8live.com/2019/04/12/mayor-latoya-cantrell-issue-apology-italian-lynching/> LOCAL FOX AFFILIATE: NEW ORLEANS

<https://www.orderisda.org/culture/news/new-orleans-mayor-to-issue-apology-over-largest-lynching-in-us-history/> ITALIAN SONS AND DAUGHTERS OF AMERICA

<https://www.orderisda.org/culture/news/new-orleans-mayor-apologizes-for-lynching-of-italians-in-1891/> ITALIAN SONS AND DAUGHTERS OF AMERICA

[https://www.theadvocate.com/baton\\_rouge/opinion/article\\_22f3b8e6-5591-11e9-8212-2f6d1ad3f927.html](https://www.theadvocate.com/baton_rouge/opinion/article_22f3b8e6-5591-11e9-8212-2f6d1ad3f927.html) THE ADVOCATE, BATON ROUGE, LA

<https://www.wvlv.com/article/news/local/orleans/mayor-cantrell-to-apologize-for-1891-lynching-of-11-italian-americans/289-e6d94cd3-7a7d-4bd3-813a-dda6b624285c> WWL: CBS AFFILIATE

<https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2019/apr/01/new-orleans-to-apologise-for-worst-mass-lynching-in-americas-history> THE GUARDIAN

<https://abcnews.go.com/US/wireStory/mayor-apologize-1861-lynching-11-italian-americans-62055901> ABC NEWS

[https://www.facebook.com/watch/live/?v=2328795927160018&ref=watch\\_permalink](https://www.facebook.com/watch/live/?v=2328795927160018&ref=watch_permalink) FOX 8 NEWS FACEBOOK PAGE

<https://www.rrstar.com/opinion/20190802/my-view-italian-americans-get-official-city-apology-from-new-orleans> RRSTAR.COM OPINION PAGE

<https://www.hernandosun.com/article/new-orleans-issues-apology-1891-mass-lynching-italians> HERNANDO SUN, FLORIDA

<https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/americas/us-politics/new-orleans-lynching-lynching-us-history-italian-latoya-cantrell-a8849416.html> THE INDEPENDENT, UK.

[https://www.esteri.it/mae/en/sala\\_stampa/archivionotizie/retediplomatica/2019/04/scuse-ufficiali-new-orleans-per-linciaggio-14-marzo-1891-di-11-italiani.html](https://www.esteri.it/mae/en/sala_stampa/archivionotizie/retediplomatica/2019/04/scuse-ufficiali-new-orleans-per-linciaggio-14-marzo-1891-di-11-italiani.html) MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS, ITALY

<http://www.loopsamoa.com/global-news/new-orleans-mayor-apologise-1891-lynching-italian-americans-83420> PACIFIC GLOBAL

<https://www.kedm.org/post/new-orleans-mayor-apologize-lynching-11-italian-americans#stream/0> PUBLIC RADIO; NPR; LA

<https://www.pri.org/file/2019-04-03/after-128-years-apology-new-orleans> WORLD RADIO INTERVIEW/BBC

<https://wrno.iheart.com/content/2019-04-12-mayor-cantrell-issues-apology-for-1891-italian-lynching/> I-HEART RADIO: FULL VIDEO OF PRESENTATION

**OTHER**

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PkcEY7zy0RQ> YOUTUBE PRESENTATION BY ORDER SONS & DAUGHERS OF ITALY IN AMERICA



### **3. ARTICLES CONNECTING THE LYNCHING WITH THE ADOPTION OF COLUMBUS DAY**

*What Columbus Day Really Means*

<https://theamericanscholar.org/what-columbus-day-really-means/#.X0CyJNxKiyo>

*The Lynching That Gave Us Columbus Day*

<https://medium.com/@nevaer1/the-lynching-that-gave-us-columbus-day-eb5179b01aca>



After 11 Italians were lynched in New Orleans in 1891, President Benjamin Harrison declared “Columbus Day” the following year to honor the contributions of Italians and Italian Americans in the U.S.

*How Italians Became “White”*

<https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2019/10/12/opinion/columbus-day-italian-american-racism.html>

### **4. Victims of the March 14, 1891 Lynching/Uprising at the OLD ORLEANS PARISH PRISON**

**The following people were lynched:**

- Antonio Bagnetto, fruit peddler: Tried and acquitted.
- James Caruso, stevedore: Not tried.
- Loreto Comitis, tinsmith: Not tried.
- Rocco Geraci, stevedore: Not tried.
- Joseph P. Macheca, fruit importer: Tried and acquitted.
- Antonio Marchesi, fruit peddler: Tried and acquitted.
- Pietro Monasterio, cobbler: Mistrial.
- Emmanuele Polizzi, street vendor: Mistrial.
- Frank Romero, ward politician: Not tried.
- Antonio Scaffidi, fruit peddler: Mistrial.
- Charles Traina, rice plantation laborer: Not tried.

**The following were killing inside the prison:**

- Rocco Geraci
- Antonio Scaffidi
- Frank Romero
- Pietro Monastero
- James Caruso
- Charles Traina
- Loretta Cornitz
- Joseph Macheca

**The following people managed to escape lynching by hiding inside the prison:**

- John Caruso, stevedore: Not tried.
- Bastian Incardona, laborer: Tried and acquitted.
- Gaspare Marchesi, 14, son of Antonio Marchesi: Tried and acquitted.
- Charles Mantranga, labor manager: Tried and acquitted.
- Peter Natali, laborer: Not tried.
- Charles Pietza (or Pietzo), grocer: Not tried.
- Charles Patorno, merchant: Not tried.
- Salvatore Sinceri, stevedore: Not tried.

**5. NEW YORK TIMES: MARCH 16, 1891 EDITORIAL.**

The *New York Times* published an editorial: **“The New Orleans Affair.”** The northern newspaper approved: ***“Nor can there be any doubt that the mob’s victims were desperate ruffians and murderers. These sneaking and cowardly Sicilians, the descendants of bandits and assassins, who have transported to this country the lawless passions, the cut-throat practices, and the oath-bound societies of their native country, are to us a pest without mitigation. Our own rattlesnakes are as good citizens as they. Our own murderers are men of feeling and nobility compared to them. These men of the Mafia killed Chief Hennessy. . . . Lynch law was the only course***



*open to the people of New Orleans to stay the issue of a new license to continue its bloody practices.”*

6. **AN OPEN LETTER TO ALL AMERICANS ON HOW *THE NEW YORK TIMES* FAILED THE ITALIAN AMERICAN COMMUNITY...and YOU (May 21, 2019)**

**AN OPEN LETTER TO ALL AMERICANS ON HOW *THE NEW YORK TIMES* FAILED THE ITALIAN AMERICAN COMMUNITY...and YOU**

Re: **LYNCHING OF 11 ITALIANS IN NEW ORLEANS**

On May 2, 2019, the signers of this OPEN LETTER hand delivered 30 copies of a 7-page letter with 68 pages of attachments, representing and endorsed by a coalition of more than 60 of the largest and most prominent Italian American organizations in the country. The packages were ear marked for the 30 members of the *New York Times* Executive Team and Editorial Board. The papers were received by a staff employee of one of the paper's counsels.

As of this moment, the *New York Times* has failed to call, respond in writing or in any way recognize the letter or the paper's outright violation of the 11 men, all of Sicilian background (some immigrants and some nationalized citizens), who were killed in a brutal manner by a mob of thousands.

We publish this letter to advise New York City residents, families of immigrants, and all in general how such a once revered newspaper has failed our community with such a cavalier “no response,” and what this means to you.

The letter called for the retraction and apology of a horrid and insulting editorial run by the paper only two days after the largest single lynching in the United States. The lynching took place at the Orleans Parish Prison in New Orleans on March 14, 1891. The initial letter explained in detail the events which led up to the mob rule and lynching that day. The underlying issues were presented with references from historical accounts, treatises, and other trusted resources, all of which supported the fact that the men were victims of a mob orchestrated by New Orleans city leaders and government officials alike.

On April 12<sup>th</sup> of this year, New Orleans Mayor LaToya Cantrell bravely appeared at a ceremony to offer an Official Proclamation of Apology with regard to the City official involvement at the time. Her forthright and moving presentation and speech gained the instant respect and honor of a host of Italian American leaders who were present from around the country.

The tragedy from 1891 was never popularized outside of the local New Orleans area. It became apparent from the research that the lynching had a major deleterious impact on the Italian American community not only in the New Orleans area, but around on a national level, and beyond. The then President and his Attorney General became involved with the issue and the Italian government withdrew their embassy representatives for about a year.

*The New York Times* reported a slanted version of the facts, maligned the Italian American community, and printed the following editorial on March 16, 1891, two days after the lynching:

***These sneaking and cowardly Sicilians, the descendants of bandits and assassins, who have transported to this country the lawless passions, the cut-throat practices, and the oath-bound societies of their native country, are to us a pest without mitigations. Our own rattlesnakes are as good citizens as they...These men of the Mafia killed Chief Hennessy in circumstances of peculiar atrocity...Lynch law was the only course open to the people of New Orleans to stay the issue of a new license to the Mafia to continue its bloody practices.***

As there was no justification for printing this material then, there is no justification for the paper's silence now. And, while 128 years have passed, there has never been a retraction or an apology from *The New York Times*. It's not too late, and the lack of a response is insulting and a quandary at the same time.

The Italian American community has made many strides in the United States; however, we have been the topic of scuttle, bias and bigotry in so many various ways. Our collective reaction has been relatively mild and complacent. **No more.** We now face active and vicious civil rights violations around the country by numerous local districts, counties and States, which have decided to eliminate Columbus Day, when Italian Americans cherish and celebrate their heritage and culture. The municipalities argue and convince themselves that Christopher Columbus' acts some 527 years ago no longer warrant having a day named after him, despite that fact that the day has become a symbolic day of "being" Italian American.

As Mayor Cantrell so aptly put it: "*What happen was wrong.*" Stating that history could not be changed, she remarked that it was important to "*acknowledge the*

wrongs so that we can grow in the future.” Our collective intent here is to ensure that our children and grandchildren no longer suffer from such vile attacks.

Our “fight” against bias is your “fight” against bias. The lesson is clear: all people from so many backgrounds simply want to live in peace, be respected and accept each other. When there is an attack on one, there is an attack on all.

When the wrong is so aptly placed in front of an educated and respected staff of 30 people and there is no response, we all should worry.

Respectfully yours,

Michael A. Santo, Esq.  
Special Counsel

## **7. COLUMBUS: ACADEMIC ARTICLES/AUTHORS TO READ**

### **MARY GRABAR**

- <https://marygrabar.com/>
- BOOK: *Debunking Howard Zinn: Exposing the Fake History That Turned a Generation against America* was published by Regnery on August 20, 2019.
  - <https://www.theahi.org/ahis-mary-grabar-why-i-wrote-debunking-howard-zinn/>
  - <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BtNfqJx4OIM>
  - <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Bo21vOpvlqs>
  - <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KEBa6nxMQVU>
  - <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YL7HvpJHKuE>

### **CAROL DELANEY**

- [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Carol\\_Delaney](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Carol_Delaney)
- <http://www.carolldelaney.com/>
- BOOK: *COLUMBUS and the Quest for Jerusalem: How Religion Drove the Voyages that led to America*: <https://www.amazon.com/Columbus-Quest-Jerusalem-Religion-Voyages/dp/1439102376>
  - <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rTwyAlmu4-w>
- <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9F3JiwFimW0>
- <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SE8br4MMjk>

### **WILLIAM J. CONNELL**

- [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/William\\_J.\\_Connell\\_\(historian\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/William_J._Connell_(historian))
- <https://historynewsnetwork.org/article/167660>
- [https://www.academia.edu/4757291/Whos\\_Afraid\\_of\\_Columbus](https://www.academia.edu/4757291/Whos_Afraid_of_Columbus)
- <https://theamericanscholar.org/what-columbus-day-really-means/#.XzAl1ohKiw4>

**Rafael: Christopher Columbus: THE HERO, Defending Columbus from Modern Day Revisionism:**

- <https://www.hpb.com/products/christopher-columbus-the-hero-defending-columbus-from-modern-day-revisionism-9781548738129>

## **8. CAMPAIGNS IN FAVOR OF COLUMBUS**

### *Editorials:*

- [The Daily Egyptian: Rediscovering Columbus \(October 8, 2002\)](#)
- [New York Times: In Person: In Defense of Columbus \(October 8, 2000\)](#)
- [The American Scholar: What Columbus Day Really Means \(October 4, 2012\)](#)
- [Scranton Times-Tribune: Some Columbus Myths Worthy of Investigation \(October 10, 2015\)](#)
- [Democracy Journal: Why Columbus Day Happened \(October 10, 2016\)](#)
- [USA Today: Christopher Columbus XX: Hey America, my ancestor didn't cause your failings \(October 9, 2017\)](#)
- [Philadelphia Inquirer: History Shows Columbus Worth Celebrating \(October 9, 2017\)](#)
- [Riverhead Local: The real Columbus: There's hard evidence that the modern recast of the great explorer is a myth \(October 7, 2018\)](#)
- [Providence Journal: Critics of Columbus don't know the real story \(October 6, 2019\)](#)
- [New York Post: It's time to stop scapegoating Christopher Columbus \(October 13, 2019\)](#)
- [New York Daily News: The whole world should honor Columbus: Declare a UN holiday for the man who helped pioneer modernity \(October 14, 2019\)](#)
- [The College Fix: Howard Zinn Lied About Christopher Columbus-- Here's How \(October 14, 2019\)](#)
- [La Voce di New York: Italian Americans and the Impact of Their Five Centuries of History in America \(May 17, 2020\)](#)
- [La Voce di New York: George Floyd and.... Columbus? The Twin "Original Sins" of the Conquest of America \(June 12, 2020\)](#)
- [Merion West: Columbus Belongs Not Only to History \(June 17, 2020\)](#)
- [La Voce di New York: In America's "Novel", Italian-Americans and Columbus Are "Cheated" and "Beaten" \(June 17, 2020\)](#)

- [Shore News Network: Creating and passing the 1492 Act will protect Italian Americans from discriminatory animus and hold vandals and officials accountable \(June 18, 2020\)](#)
- [Providence Journal: Vandalizing Columbus Statues Insults Italian Americans \(June 20, 2020\)](#)
- [Scranton Times-Tribune: Scranton's Columbus Statue a Symbol of Pride \(June 22, 2020\)](#)
- [The Baltimore Sun: Columbus statues need context, not disrespect and desecration \(June 26, 2020\)](#)
- [Stamford Advocate: Opinion: Former Stamford Mayor Esposito says removal of Columbus statue would be 'an insult' \(June 27, 2020\)](#)
- [NewportRI.com: Newport's Columbus statue meant as a celebration of Italian culture \(June 29, 2020\)](#)
- [Miami Herald: Don't tear down Columbus because of this country's horribly racist past \(June 30, 2020\)](#)
- [Newport This Week: Statue Represents Italians' Love of America \(July 2, 2020\)](#)
- [Hartford Courant: It's time America confronts racism. But Columbus does not belong in this discussion \(July 2, 2020\)](#)
- [NJ.com: Columbus sailed into rightful place in history books \(July 3, 2020\)](#)
- [New Haven Register: Proud of Columbus \(July 5, 2020\)](#)
- [Baltimore Sun: Demolition of Columbus statue an insult to Italian Americans \(July 6, 2020\)](#)
- [McDuffie Progress: Poor Ole Christopher Columbus \(July 7, 2020\)](#)
- [Stamford Advocate: Daughter of Stamford's first Italian-American mayor says Columbus statue and park must stay in city \(July 8, 2020\)](#)
- [Broad + Liberty: Leftist Attacks on Columbus are Bad History \(July 8, 2020\)](#)
- [National Review: In Defense of Saints and Statues \(July 10, 2020\)](#)
- [Lowell Sun: Get history straight when arguing over Christopher Columbus \(July 10, 2020\)](#)
- [Worcester Telegram: Christopher Columbus Launched the American Dream \(July 10, 2020\)](#)
- [Daily Citizen: EDITORIAL: Myths, reality and perspective on Christopher Columbus, statues and protesters \(July 10, 2020\)](#)
- [The Baltimore Sun: Relearning Christopher Columbus \(July 12, 2020\)](#)
- [Cape Cod Times: Mob mentality driving statue discussions \(July 15, 2020\)](#)
- [Fra Noi: What Columbus Stands For \(July 19, 2020\)](#)
- [Fredericksburg.com: Clarifying the Columbus 'cancel' controversy \(July 20, 2020\)](#)
- [Tap Into Scotch Plains: Removing the Columbus Monument Would Be Disrespectful to Scotch Plains Italian-Americans \(July 21, 2020\)](#)
- [Republican American: Hate Crime Targets Italian Americans \(July 21, 2020\)](#)
- [Syracuse.com: Columbus monument honors struggles of Italian-Americans who built it \(July 22, 2020\)](#)
- [Chicago Tribune: Removal of the Columbus statues has left a hole in the heart of our Italian American community \(July 24, 2020\)](#)
- [The Morning Call: Attacks on Columbus Unfair, Unfounded \(July 31, 2020\)](#)

- [Suburban Chicagoland: Taking down the Columbus Statue is an act of racism \(August 3, 2020\)](#)
- [Roanoke.com: Canova: Christopher Columbus Monuments \(August 3, 2020\)](#)
- [The Salem News: Don't shun Columbus \(August 3, 2020\)](#)
- [Staten Island Live: Let Columbus Stand \(August 5, 2020\)](#)
- [Wicked Local Beverly: Keep Christopher Columbus's Name, History Alive \(August 6, 2020\)](#)
- [Rrstar.com: Trump Stands Up for Italian Heritage \(August 6, 2020\)](#)
- [Intellectual Takeout: Abolishing History From the Classroom Is What Got Us Into This Mess \(August 6, 2020\)](#)
- [Wicked Local Wellesley: Our Campaign for Inclusion and Respect \(August 8, 2020\)](#)
- [Youngstown Vindicator: Columbus should be honored, not defiled \(August 9, 2020\)](#)
- [Chicago Now: When Symbols Go Bad \(August 9, 2020\)](#)
- [Leavenworth Times: Statues Stand for Something \(August 16, 2020\)](#)
- [Fra Noi: Fighting Fiction with Facts \(August 16, 2020\)](#)
- [The Conversation: Ancient cancel cultures: The defacement of statues in America replicates a tradition going back millennia \(August 19, 2020\)](#)

#### *News Articles:*

- [Anthropologist says Christopher Columbus critics have their history wrong \(April 29, 2019\)](#)
- [Don't tear down Columbus statues; use them to confront history and trigger 'reckoning,' Lightfoot says \(June 18, 2020\)](#)
- [Sons of Italy of Hammonton Relocates Christopher Columbus Statue \(June 19, 2020\)](#)
- [Christopher Columbus Name Won't Be Changed at Wisconsin Catholic High School \(June 19, 2020\)](#)
- [Dueling Petitions Address Utica's Columbus Statue \(June 19, 2020\)](#)
- [How Christopher Columbus Came to Stand in Boston's North End \(June 19, 2020\)](#)
- [Online Petition Started in East Hanover to Save the Christopher Columbus Statue \(June 21, 2020\)](#)
- [As Columbus statues fall across the country, Easton has no plans to remove its sculpture \(June 22, 2020\)](#)
- [Dueling Petitions Address Columbus Statue in Norwich \(June 22, 2020\)](#)
- [Columbus Statues Should Come Down, Activists Say — But Mayor, Italian Americans Want Them To Stay \(June 23, 2020\)](#)
- [Chicago's Italian American Community Reacts to Defacement of Christopher Columbus Statues \(June 23, 2020\)](#)
- [President Trump to Issue Executive Order on Statue Vandalism \(June 24, 2020\)](#)
- [The Story Behind the Christopher Columbus Statue in Denver \(June 24, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian-Americans' Plea: Don't Tear Down Columbus Statues \(June 25, 2020\)](#)
- [Opponents of removing Columbus statue rally in New Haven \(June 24, 2020\)](#)

- [Syracuse's Columbus statue debate: Why we should remove it and why we should keep it \(June 25, 2020\)](#)
- [Baltimore County Republicans, Italian Americans Call For Protection Of City Columbus Monuments \(June 26, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian Americans call removal of Columbus statues in Chicago 'insensitive' to their history \(July 26, 2020\)](#)
- [State delegates, Italian American activists calling for protection of Columbus statues \(June 26, 2020\)](#)
- [Biden: Feds obligated to protect Washington, Jefferson, Columbus statues \(June 30, 2020\)](#)
- [New Haven Italian-American group wants police protection for Columbus pedestal \(July 1, 2020\)](#)
- [Cardinal Dolan Decries Statue Destruction, Warns Against Dangerous "Cultural Revolution" \(July 2, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian American ONE VOICE Coalition Successfully Defeats Proposal to Eliminate Federal Columbus Day Holiday \(July 6, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian-American leaders plan to restore, relocate Columbus statue \(July 7, 2020\)](#)
- [Denver's Italian-American community fights to keep Columbus Park from being renamed \(July 8, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian restaurant owner puts up controversial Christopher Columbus billboard in Milford \(July 8, 2020\)](#)
- [Denver's Italian-American community fights to keep Columbus Park from being renamed \(July 9, 2020\)](#)
- [Effort underway to save and repair beheaded Christopher Columbus statue in Waterbury \(July 9, 2020\)](#)
- [Columbus donors sue Penn's Landing agency to keep monument; commissions seek comments on South Philly statue removal \(July 13, 2020\)](#)
- [Baltimore Italian American Group Pens Letter to Nancy Pelosi \(July 13, 2020\)](#)
- [Tap Into Scotch Plains/Fanwood: Columbus: Fact vs. Fiction \(July 14, 2020\)](#)
- [Easton's Christopher Columbus statue topic of virtual discussion about public art \(July 15, 2020\)](#)
- [Disputes over Christopher Columbus statues play out in court \(July 15, 2020\)](#)
- [Supporters rally for Columbus statue in Syracuse. It's about 1934, they say, not 1492 \(July 16, 2020\)](#)
- [Statue Supporters Rally At Columbus Circle \(Syracuse\) \(July 16, 2020\)](#)
- [9-Foot Tall Christopher Columbus Statue To Remain On Ohio Statehouse Grounds Until At Least 2025 \(July 16, 2020\)](#)
- [Supporters hold rally to keep Christopher Columbus Monument in Syracuse \(July 16, 2020\)](#)
- [Christopher Columbus Statue To Remain On Ohio Statehouse Grounds For Now \(July 17, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian-Americans in Bridgeport demand return of Columbus statue to community park \(July 19, 2020\)](#)
- [Worcester's Christopher Columbus statue stays, as City Council votes against removal \(July 21, 2020\)](#)



- [Knights of Columbus pick Christopher Columbus statue from Baltimore's Inner Harbor, plan to reproduce monument \(July 21, 2020\)](#)
- [Baltimore Italian American Community Plans New Statue to Honor Columbus \(July 22, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian-American organizations march in support of Christopher Columbus statue \(July 22, 2020\)](#)
- [Scotch Plains Votes to Keep Columbus Monument in Place \(July 22, 2020\)](#)
- ['What's next?' Rage greets city plan to remove Marconi Plaza's Christopher Columbus statue \(July 22, 2020\)](#)
- [Worcester Will Not Move Christopher Columbus Statue \(July 22, 2020\)](#)
- [Some Italian-Americans outraged over removal of Christopher Columbus statues in Chicago \(July 24, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian American groups plan celebration of Christopher Columbus in Woodland Park \(July 25, 2020\)](#)
- [Crowd Rallies In Defense Of Christopher Columbus Statues \(July 26, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian-American groups to host 'Rediscover Columbus' NJ event \(July 26, 2020\)](#)
- [Bridgeport Council to meet on returning Christopher Columbus statue \(July 27, 2020\)](#)
- [Meet the people who are buying America's rejected statues \(August 1, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian-American organization member defends Columbus statue \(August 1, 2020\)](#)
- [On this Day: 1492: Columbus Sets Sail \(August 3, 2020\)](#)
- [Italian heritage group asks Kearny to protect Columbus statue with anti-graffiti 'film' \(August 4, 2020\)](#)
- [Take that, Chicago: Springfield Italian American group mounts boycott over Columbus statues \(August 6, 2020\)](#)
- [Some Members Of Italian-American Community Want Columbus Statues Put Back On Display \(August 6, 2020\)](#)
- [Motion filed after Philadelphia Art commission votes to remove Christopher Columbus statue, place it in temporary storage \(August 12, 2020\)](#)
- [Activists calling for cities to preserve Christopher Columbus statues in Boston, other cities \(August 13, 2020\)](#)
- [As monuments to Christopher Columbus come down across the US, Italian-Americans campaign to protect a symbol of 'culture heritage' \(August 13, 2020\)](#)
- [NYPD: Columbus Statue gets 24-Hour Police Protection in Belmont \(August 15, 2020\)](#)
- [Members Of Italian-American Community Call For Return Of Columbus Statues \(August 16, 2020\)](#)
- [Did Christopher Columbus bring syphilis to Europe? Study puts myth to rest \(August 17, 2020\)](#)
- [City aldermen agree to put Columbus statue's fate to voters at November election \(August 18, 2020\)](#)

#### Videos:

- [Columbus: Fact & Fiction](#)
- [The Daily Wire: Ep. 37: Christopher Columbus Actually Was a Great Man](#)



- [In Defense of Columbus: An Exaggerated Evil](#)

*Documentaries:*

- [Columbus Day Legacy. By Bennie Klain \(Navajo\). A TricksterFilms, LLC Production, 2011. 27 minutes. DVD format, color. \(Review attached\)](#)

*Essays:*

- [De las Casas' Writings on Columbus by José Gueits Romero](#)
- [Killing Columbus: An Attack on an Italian American Heritage Icon by Ernest R. Nuzzo, Esq.](#)
- [Columbus and the Great Contact: Before and After by Ernest R. Nuzzo, Esq.](#)
- [Of Statues and Symbolic Murder by Wilfred M. McClay](#)
- [Christopher Columbus: The Unknown Lateral Thinker by Dr. Rudy Magnan](#)
- [Why Columbus Day Matters to Italian Americans by Bill Cerrutti, Executive Director, Italian Cultural Society, Sacramento](#)

*Podcasts/Radio Shows:*

- [Ron Onesti on Christopher Columbus statues: 'There has to be a proper process' \(July 31, 2020\)](#)
- [Shaping Opinion Podcast: Who Was Christopher Columbus? \(July 20, 2020\)](#)
- [Cats at Night with John Catsimatidis: American Way of Life Under Attack \(July 1, 2020\)](#)
- [The Brian Lehrer Show: What Columbus Statues Really Mean \(October 9, 2017\)](#)
- [Italian American Podcast: IAP 112: When Did Columbus Become an Italian American? An Honest Exploration of the History of the Columbus Day Holiday](#)
- [Italian American Podcast: IAP 114: Can't We All Just Get Along? Varied Voices Revisit the Legacy of Christopher Columbus](#)
- [Italian American Podcast: IAP 152: Conversations on Columbus: Introduction](#)
- [Italian American Podcast: IAP 153: Conversations on Columbus: Straight from the Source](#)

*Media Outlets with Extensive Pro Columbus Coverage:*

- [We the Italians](#)
- [PRIMO Magazine](#)
- [Giornale Italoamericano](#)
- [Italian Tribune](#)
- [La Gazzetta Italiana](#)

*International Coverage in English*

- [Italian Americans say Chicago mayor Lori Lightfoot is 'giving in to violence and cancel culture' by removing statues of Christopher Columbus and accuse her of 'siding with a destructive minority'](#)
- [Things That Seem Incredible: A New Columbus Letter](#)

- [Christopher Columbus did not bring syphilis to Europe: Sexually transmitted disease was spreading across the continent almost 100 years BEFORE the Italian navigator first set sail for the Americas, study reveals](#)

#### News from Italy:

- [Assalto a Cristoforo Colombo nell'America Democratica \(August 5, 2020\)](#)
- [Capone \(Ugl\): "Uno sfregio agli italiani la distruzione della statua di Colombo" \(July 13, 2020\)](#)
- [Christopher Magazine](#)

#### Miscellaneous:

- [Ad in the Washington Times from the Patriotic Veterans of America](#)

#### Books:

- [Columbus Day et les Italiens de New York. By Marie-Christine Michaud. Paris: Ed. Presse Universitaire Paris-Sorbonne, 2011. 227 pages. \(Review in English attached\)](#)
- *Religion in Latin America: A Documentary History* by Lee M. Penyak and Walter J. Petry. Orbis Books, 2007. (Primary Document 8/ Page 19 focuses on Columbus)
- *Religion and Society in Latin America* by Lee M. Penyak and Walter J. Petry. Orbis Books, 2009. (Pages 28-29 focus on Columbus)
- [The Life of Christopher Columbus by J.J. Barry. Loreto Publications.](#)
- *Columbus and the Quest for Jerusalem: How Religion Drove the Voyages that Led to America* by Carol Delaney. Free Press, 2012.
- *Debunking Howard Zinn: Exposing the Fake History That Turned a Generation against America* by Mary Grabar. Regnery History, 2020.
- [Christopher Columbus The Hero: Defending Columbus From Modern Day Revisionism by Rafael Ortiz. Create Space, 2017.](#)
- [Admiral of the Ocean Sea: A Life of Christopher Columbus by Samuel Eliot Morison. Little, Brown, and Company, 1991.](#)
- [The Four Voyages: Being His Own Log-Book, Letters and Dispatches with Connecting Narratives by Christopher Columbus. Penguin Classics, 1992.](#)
- [The Enemies of Christopher Columbus: Answers to Critical Questions About the Spread of Western Civilization by Thomas A. Bowden. Paper Tiger Inc., 2003.](#)
- [The Life of the Admiral Christopher Columbus: by his son Ferdinand by Benjamin Keen, Editor. Rutgers University Press, 1992.](#)

#### Academic Essays

- [Who's Afraid of Columbus? by William Connell Italian Americana, 31.2 \(Summer 2013\), pp. 136-147](#)
- **Columbus Day, a Celebration Revisited by The Denver Post, 2000-2007** by Marie-Christine Michaud, in John Paul Russo et Teri Ann Tengiveno (dir), Italian Passages, AIHA, Denver, USA, p. 88-107 (2010)

- ***The Columbus Day Parade in New York City: a New Form of Marketing or an Ethnic Festival?*** by Marie-Christine Michaud, in Stefano Luconi et Dennis Barone (dir), *Small Towns, Big Cities*, AIHA, New Haven, USA, p. 86-104 (2010)
- **Columbus's name in the space of American collective memory: from consecration to desecration** by Luisa Caiazzo, University of Basilicata, Italy. (2017) Downloaded from Academia.edu, 12 pp.
- **Christopher Columbus in United States Historiography: Biography as Projection** by Carla Rahn Phillips. (1992) Downloaded from Academia.edu, 20 pp.
- **The Triumph of American Spectacle: New York City's 1892 Columbian Celebration** by David Carletta. (2008) Downloaded from Academia.edu, 24 pp.
- **"Rediscovering Columbus in Nineteenth-Century American Textbooks"**, in S. Carvalho et F. Gemenne, *Nations and their Histories. Constructions and Representations*. Palgrave MacMillan, 2009, p.93-110. Downloaded from Academia.edu.
- **Irving's Columbus and Hemispheric American History** by Jordan Wingate. (2017) Downloaded from Academia.edu, 34 pp.
- **A Content Analysis of Selected Secondary History Textbooks' Portrayals of Christopher Columbus, Hernan Cortes, and Francisco Pizarro** by Jebadiah Lillejord. (2014) Downloaded from Academia.edu, 10 pp.
- **Columbus's Ultimate Goal: Jerusalem** by Carol Delaney (Date not listed) Downloaded from Academia.edu, 34 pp.
- **It's a Strange Thing: The Millennial Blindness of Christopher Columbus** by John Hubers (Date not listed) Downloaded from Academia.edu, 32 pp.
- **Reading Cristóbal Colón within Millennial Iberia** by Seán Kearns, University of Liverpool (2014). Downloaded from Academia.edu, 50 pp.
- **Christopher Columbus, a dual identity: citizen of Valencia and "Genoese of nation"** by Francesc L. Albardaner (2016). Downloaded from Academia.edu, 17 pp.
- **And there was Honey: Translating Contact into Discovery in the Columbus Letters** by Monica Espaillat Lizardo, University of Toronto (2014). Downloaded from Academia.edu, 21 pp.
- **Reading Columbus** by Margarita Zamora (1996). Downloaded from Academia.edu, 7 pp.
- **Columbus's Gift: Representations of Grace and Wealth and the Enterprise of the Indies**. *Modern Languages Notes* 119 (2004): 201-25 by Elvira Vilches. Downloaded from Academia.edu, 26 pp.
- **1492: Europe in America and America in Europe: Or, Traveling Metaphors in the Discoveries of America** by Boris Vejdovsky (2008). Downloaded from Academia.edu, 15 pp.

## Social Media Posts

### Instagram:

- **Zio Ciccio Cinema: How Do You Feel About Columbus Statues?**

Facebook

- [New Theory Magazine: Should Italian-Americans Defend Christopher Columbus](#)
- [Michael Knowles torches anti-Columbus "cowards, ingrates, & moral narcissists"](#)

*On Howard Zinn*

- [Reclaiming History From Howard Zinn \(May 17, 2019\)](#)

**9: YOUTUBE VIDEOS AS TO THE "APOLOGY"**

BRIED SEGMENT ON THE HISTORY OF THE LYNCHING

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PkcEY7zy0RQ>

MAYOR CANTRELL'S PRESENTATION

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HEwK-gtqmvw>

**10: RESOLUTION TO COONSERVE HISTORY AND COMBAT PREJUDICE---  
CHRISTOPHER COLUMBUS, AS ADOPTED BY THE NATIONAL REPUBLICAN  
RESOLUTIONS COMMITTEE: 2020**



## **RESOLUTION TO CONSERVE HISTORY AND COMBAT PREJUDICE – CHRISTOPHER COLUMBUS**

WHEREAS, The men and women who have made historically significant, positive contributions to humanity are universally complex figures;

WHEREAS, Christopher Columbus was a courageous, determined, faithful man of vision, whose voyage to the Americas linked two continents and initiated the exchange of ideas, plants, animals, resources, and peoples, and ultimately laid the foundation for the birth of the United States of America;

WHEREAS, America's uniquely dynamic culture, and the Western Civilizations upon which it is founded, have done more to advance freedom, promote equality, lift people from poverty, and advance human dignity than any other culture, movement, or ideology in human history;

WHEREAS, The expansion of Western Civilization, and the establishment of the United States of America, has led to an ever-improving, free and equal society benefitting all Americans;

WHEREAS, Christopher Columbus and his voyage exemplify the contributions that millions of American men and women with Italian heritage have made to our nation's ideals and society; and

WHEREAS, The Knights of Columbus, the Catholic fraternal order with an estimated two million members selected at a time of rampant anti-Catholic prejudice, Christopher Columbus as their namesake to recognize and celebrate the indispensable role of a Catholic Christian in the origin of America's adventurous and free national destiny; therefore, be it

*RESOLVED*, That the Republican National Committee (RNC) supports the celebration of the discoveries and contributions of Christopher Columbus, his courage despite unbelievable hardship, and the role he played in connecting the world and creating a new and dynamic civilization in the Americas;

*RESOLVED*, That the RNC encourages public educational institutions to celebrate Columbus' unparalleled contributions to human connectedness, his role in the creation of America, and his importance as a figurehead for Americans facing anti-Italian and anti-Catholic prejudice; and

*RESOLVED*, That the RNC affirms the need to take a strong position in support of our founding ideals, and in solidarity against anti-Italian and anti-Catholic prejudice, by defending Columbus Day as a federal holiday and urging all Republican candidates to do the same.

Paid for by the Republican National Committee  
Not Authorized By Any Candidate Or Candidate's Committee  
[www.gop.com](http://www.gop.com)



## **12. PRESIDENT BENJAMIN HARRISON: PROCLAMATION 335---400<sup>TH</sup> ANNIVERSARY OF THE DISCOVERY OF AMERICA**

### **A Proclamation**

Whereas by a joint resolution approved June 29, 1892, it was resolved by the Senate and House of Representatives of the United States of America in Congress assembled--

That the President of the United States be authorized and directed to issue a proclamation recommending to the people the observance in all their localities of the four hundredth anniversary of the discovery of America, on the 21st of October, 1892, by public demonstrations and by suitable exercises in their schools and other places of assembly.

Now, therefore, I, Benjamin Harrison, President of the United States of America, in pursuance of the aforesaid joint resolution, do hereby appoint Friday, October 21, 1892, the four hundredth anniversary of the discovery of America by Columbus, **as a general holiday for the people of the United States. On that day let the people, so far as possible, cease from toil and devote themselves to such exercises as may best express honor to the discoverer and their appreciation of the great achievements of the four completed centuries of American life.**

Columbus stood in his age as the pioneer of progress and enlightenment. The system of universal education is in our age the most prominent and salutary feature of the spirit of enlightenment, and it is peculiarly appropriate that the schools be made by the people the center of the day's demonstration. Let the national flag float over every schoolhouse in the country and the exercises be such as shall impress upon our youth the patriotic duties of American citizenship.

In the churches and in the other places of assembly of the people let there be expressions of gratitude to Divine Providence for the devout faith of the discoverer and for the divine care and guidance which has directed our history and so abundantly blessed our people.

In testimony whereof I have hereunto set my hand and caused the Seal of the United States to be affixed.

Done at the city of Washington, this 21st day of July, A.D. 1892, and of the Independence of the United States the one hundred and seventeenth.

BENJ. HARRISON

By the President:

John W. Foster, *Secretary of State*.

Benjamin Harrison, Proclamation 335—400th Anniversary of the Discovery of America by Columbus  
Online by Gerhard Peters and John T. Woolley, The American Presidency Project  
<https://www.presidency.ucsb.edu/node/205141>

### **13: Debunking "Top 5 Atrocities committed by Christopher Columbus"**

#### **Debunking "Top 5 Atrocities Committed by Christopher Columbus"**

<http://www.officialchristophercolumbus.com/2020/06/debunking-top-5-atrocities-committed-by.html>

This so-called [Top 5 atrocities committed by Christopher Columbus](#) is being used by some people on the internet. Apparently, the article is affiliated with the Associated Press somehow. The first thing to notice is that the source for the article is Howard Zinn, who was not a primary historical source, but a history revisionist of the 20th century. Zinn's arguments have gained popularity lately due to his connections with Hollywood celebrities and many mainstream media outlets before he died.

When it comes to Columbus, Zinn had the bad habit of putting two or more sentences together that have nothing to do with each other, to make it say whatever he wanted you to think it says. That's what he did for ALL the claims below. So let's take a closer look at his arguments and then debunk them.

#### **'We could subjugate them all'**

Here is Zinn (mis)quoting Columbus:

"They ... brought us parrots and balls of cotton and spears and many other things ... They willingly traded everything they owned ... They were well-built, with good bodies and handsome features... They do not bear arms, and do not know them, for I showed them a sword, they took it by the edge and cut themselves out of ignorance. They have no iron. Their spears are made of cane. ... They would make fine servants. ... With fifty men we could subjugate them all and make them do whatever we want." Columbus would add: "As soon as I arrived in the Indies, on the first Island which I found, I took some of the natives by force in order that they might learn and might give me information of whatever there is in these parts."

Zinn wants to give the impression the natives received Columbus with presents ("They ... brought us parrots and balls of cotton and spears and many other things."), but it was Columbus who gave them presents instead. Because of Columbus's generosity, they later returned with gifts and things for trade. Here is the actual account:

"Soon many of the islanders gathered round us. I could see that they were people who would be more easily converted to our Holy Faith by love than by coercion, and wishing them to look on us with friendship I gave some of them red bonnets and glass beads which they hung round their necks, and many other things of small value, at which they were so delighted and so eager to please us that we could not believe it. Later they swam out to the boats to bring us parrots and balls of cotton thread and darts, and many other things, exchanging them for such objects as glass beads and hawk bells. They took anything, and gave willingly whatever they had."

*Source: Columbus' Own Journal translated by John Cummins, Friday, October 12, 1492, p. 94. (Emphases are mine).*

When Columbus said the natives “do not bear arms,” he meant they did not have a European style of arms. But they did have weapons, and also “scars on their bodies” because “people from other islands nearby came to capture them and they defended themselves.” *Source: Own Journal translated by John Cummins, Friday, October 12, 1492, p. 94.*

Also, Columbus did not say the natives “would make good servants.” That’s a lie. Columbus said they “MUST BE good servants,” as one who served a king, and not one who is a slave. Here is the sentence: “They must be good servants, and intelligent, for I can see that they quickly repeat everything said to them. I believe they would readily become Christians.” *Source: Columbus Own Journal translated by John Cummins, Friday, October 12, 1492, p. 94.*

The natives had both servants and slaves.

As for the statement “With fifty men we could subjugate them all,” it was written 3 days later, on another island and under another context. Zinn added that sentence next to the “servants” quote to give the impression Columbus was thinking about slavery from the very first day he arrived to America. So, what does the “with fifty men” statement mean? Columbus perceived the natives of the first islands he visited were not skillful in battle, therefore he was assuring the queen, to whom his journal was addressed to, that he could defeat them or conquer them with just a few men IF he had to fight them. That’s all he meant.

Though Columbus initially took six or seven natives against their will (to help him travel the uncharted waters), he almost immediately changed the approach, when one of them escaped. He decided to take a native aboard, give him gifts, and then let him go. That way he was telling them his intentions were good. Remember, Columbus did not know their language, and the natives did not know his. Here is the account:

“By now another small almadia was approaching the Niña from a different headland with one man in it who had come to barter a ball of cotton. He did not want to come aboard, so some of the sailors jumped into the sea and captured him. I saw all this from the deck of the sterncastle, so I sent for him; I gave him a red bonnet and put a few little green glass beads on his arm and hung two bells from his ears. I had him put back in his almadia, which had also been taken aboard the ship’s boat, and sent him back ashore. I then made sail to go to the other large island which I could see to the westward, and I ordered the other almadia which the Niña was towing astern to be set adrift. When the man to whom I had given gifts, refusing his ball of cotton, reached the shore I saw that all the others came up to him. He was amazed and thought that we were good people and that the other who had escaped was being taken with us because he had done us some harm. That was my purpose in giving him presents and letting him go: to make them think well of us, so that when Your Majesties send someone else here he may be well received.” *Source: Columbus Own Journal translated by John Cummins, Monday, October 15, 1492, p. 98.*

From that point, Columbus was received as a hero everywhere he went in the Caribbean. The natives (Tainos) believed Columbus was sent by God to save them from the Caribs, a tribe of cannibals who constantly terrorized them. The Caribs would hunt the Tainos, raping their women, castrating the boys, and killing the men. They cannibalized entire islands before Columbus’ arrival. Ironically, Zinn omitted all that information. At the end of the first voyage, Columbus made a treaty with one of the Taino chiefs of Hispaniola island, named Guacanagari.



Columbus promised the chief that he would protect him from the Caribs when he returns for a second voyage. This kind of alliance, where two different groups unite to fight a common enemy, was common back then. *Source: The Life of the Admiral by Ferdinand Columbus, Chapters 24-34.* See also the accounts by Martyr, Oviedo, Las Casas, Bernaldez, etc.

## **Slavery and gold**

Zinn:

“Columbus had two goals in the Caribbean: to find gold and slaves. Columbus returned home to Spain and came back to the Caribbean with 17 ships and 1,200 men. His men traveled from island to island, taking Indians as captives. In 1495, in a large slave raid, Columbus and his men rounded up 1,500 Arawak men, women, and children, and put them in pens. They selected what they considered the best natives and loaded them onto ships back to Spain. Two hundred died en route. After the survivors were sold as slaves in Spain, Columbus later wrote: ‘Let us in the name of the Holy Trinity go on sending all the slaves that can be sold.’ ”

Zinn’s statement above is false. Columbus’ goals were gold and spices. The Tainos were his allies, and Columbus was commanded by the queen to punish anyone, including Spaniards, who would mistreat them. When Columbus returned to the New World, he fulfilled his promise about the Caribs. He either destroyed their canoes, so they could not sail again to terrorize the Tainos, or would capture them and send them to Spain as prisoners of war. However, when Columbus arrived in Hispaniola, he found 39 of his men, he left there, dead. A rival chief to Guacanagari killed them. Columbus decided to settle in another part of the island and for almost a year, he did everything he could do to keep the peace between him and the rival chiefs. Columbus was forced to arrest some of them later because they started to kill more of his men again. A month later, chief Guacanagari asked Columbus to help him fight the rival chiefs, because they killed and kidnapped some of his wives (chiefs were polygamous). Columbus agreed, since they had killed his men. Columbus fought them, defeated them and sent some of them (along with the cannibals) to Spain, as prisoners of war. That is the so-called “slave raid” Zinn claimed happened. When Columbus said, “Let us in the name of the Holy Trinity go on sending all the slaves that can be sold,” he meant the cannibals or those who were rivals to his ally, chief Guacanagari, in Hispaniola. Though it is true, many of them died en route, it’s also true that many of the 1,200 people who came with Columbus died as well for a diverse number of reasons. Do you see how much of the story and context Zinn left out? *Source: The Life of the Admiral by Ferdinand Columbus, Chapters 47-61.*

## **Blood for gold**

“But slaves weren’t enough for Columbus or the Spanish monarchy. Columbus needed to bring back gold. Columbus and his crew believed there were gold fields in the province of Cibao on Haiti. He and his men ordered all natives 14 years or older to collect a certain amount of gold every three months. Natives who didn’t collect enough gold had their hands cut off. But it was an impossible task. There was virtually no gold around; only a little dust in streams. Many natives fled and were consequently hunted down and killed by the Spaniards.”

That statement is false too. After Columbus defeated the rival chiefs in battle, sending some of them away to Spain, he made the rest to pay tribute. This was the norm during battles back then. Also, there was gold. EVERY primary source of this era says so. The claim that cutting their hands off was the punishment for not paying the tribute, is a lie as well. However, the

tribute was hard to accomplish, which is why Columbus reduced the quota to half. Another important detail about the so-called “slavery” is that it was temporal. Columbus even told the chiefs he arrested; he would restore them back to power. *Source: Historia de los Reyes Católicos by Andrés Bernaldez, Cap. CXXXI, p. 331*

The reason for the tribute and the temporal slavery was to keep the chiefs from bickering with one another or keeping them from killing more Spaniards. Columbus obtained peace for a while, which was his goal. In the meantime, Columbus punished any Spaniard that mistreated a native, as he was commanded by the queen to do. *Source: The Life of the Admiral by Ferdinand Columbus, Chapter 61.*

## Cruelty

“If captivity and death weren’t enough, Columbus and his men had a particular reputation for cruelty. Bartolome de las Casas, a young priest who participated in the conquest of Cuba and wrote a history of the Indies, describes the treatment of the natives: ‘Endless testimonies ... prove the mild and pacific temperament of the natives... But our work was to exasperate, ravage, kill, mangle and destroy; small wonder, then, if they tried to kill one of us now and then... The admiral, it is true, was blind as those who came after him, and he was so anxious to please the King that he committed irreparable crimes against the Indians ...’ Las Casas describes how Spaniards rode on the backs of natives. How the Spaniards ‘thought nothing of knifing Indians by tens and twenties and of cutting slices off them to test the sharpness of their blades.’ Las Casas adds ‘two of these so-called Christians met two Indian boys one day, each carrying a parrot; they took the parrots and for fun beheaded the boys.’”

When Columbus returned to Hispaniola, for his third voyage, he found it in mutiny and revolt. Several Spanish political rivals tried to take over, but failed. They succeeded when they falsely accused Columbus as a cruel man toward both Spaniards and natives. They arrested Columbus without due process, and took the governorship upon themselves. When the king and queen heard about it, they immediately set Columbus free because they did not believe the accusations. In their own way, the king and queen apologized to him. They also arrested those who arrested Columbus first, for mutiny, and the temporal slavery on Hispaniola was suspended. As for Columbus, his titles were restored and he made one more voyage. *Source: The Life of the Admiral by Ferdinand Columbus, Chapters 74-87*

Zinn’s quote above, who in turn was quoting from Fray Las Casas, belongs to the timeline when the mutineers took over Hispaniola causing all sorts of trouble to the natives. Columbus himself reported to the queen the very same things Las Casas complained about. Las Casas did not believe the accusations that cost Columbus the governorship either. Las Casas even said that even if the accusations were true (that Columbus was cruel toward the Spaniards), then they deserved it, since they were the ones committing all sorts of atrocities. *Source: Historia de las Indias by Las Casas, Libro I, Tomo II, Capítulo CLXXXIII, pp. 513-514.*

Las Casas’ only disagreement with Columbus was about the few times he fought the natives. Las Casas labeled those battles “unjust wars,” even if justified. As a priest, he believed the natives would go to hell when they die fighting for not knowing the One true God. An “unjust war” was a crime to Las Casas. That’s why Las Casas said Columbus “committed irreparable crimes against the Indians.”

Zinn fails to explain that Las Casas was also the person responsible for creating or propagating the Spanish Black Legend and the Myth of the Noble Savage. That is, the idea that all Spaniards were evil, while all natives were angels. *Source: History of the Indies by Las Casas, Introduction by A. Collard.*

Las Casas' works were translated into other languages and were used as political propaganda against Spain. The problem with Las Casas was that he did not distinguish what was war and what was abuse. Eventually Las Casas books were banned by Spain and the Catholic church. The few times Columbus fought native tribes, he did it at the request or with the assistance of other tribes, who were allied with him.

The irony is that Las Casas admired Columbus and he defended his honor against those who were trying to discredit him. In the very same book (*History of the Indies*), Las Casas described Columbus as: "imposing, good natured, kind, daring, courageous... a pious man... God had endowed him good judgment, a sound memory and eagerness to learn... a God fearing man..." p. 15. "... the most outstanding sailor in the world, versed like no other in the art of navigation, for which divine Providence chose him to accomplish the most outstanding feat ever accomplished in the world until now." p. 17. "... he was well-mannered, handsome man and a churchgoing Christian..." p. 19. "... well spoken, wise and prudent." p. 29. "Many is the time I have wished that God would again inspire me and that I had Cicero's gift of eloquence to extol the indescribable service to God and to the whole world which Christopher Columbus rendered at the cost of such pain and dangers, such skill and expertise, when he so courageously discovered the New World." pp. 34-35. The last thing Las Casas said about Columbus was that "he was a good Christian." p. 143.

### **Mass genocide**

"Facing extermination, the Arawaks organized and attempted to fight back against the Spaniards. But they were little match against the armor, muskets, swords and horses of the Europeans. The Spaniards hung or burned Indians that they took captive. By this point, the Arawaks began committing mass suicides. They fed cassava poison to their infants to save them from the Spanish. In two years, half of the 250,000 Indians on Haiti were dead, either through murder, mutilation or suicide. By 1550, there were 500 Indians. By 1650, the Arawaks had been wiped out from the island."

After Columbus finished his fourth and last voyage, this time exploring Central and South America, he made a last stop on Hispaniola (before he returned to Spain) and noticed that many natives had died. He wrote (again) complaining about how they were mistreated under the Nicolas de Ovando administration. *Source: Historia de las Indias by Las Casas, Tomo III, Lib. II, Cap. XXXVII, p. 190.*

The reason why some Spaniards behaved so badly was because they were far away from Spain, where no one could see what they were doing. *Source: De Orbe Novo by Peter Martyr, Vol. Two, Book IV, p. 272.*

As long as Columbus was alive and in charge, he would punish them, arrest them or report them. After Columbus died, the next group of people exposing this kind of corruption were the priests. The problem with Zinn's quote is that they are about events that happened after Columbus was dead. Every primary source of this era condemned those evil acts, precisely because it was unlawful and against the policies of Spain.

Another problem with Zinn and other revisionists is that they won't mention that the native tribes were doing the same things they condemned others of doing. That includes wars, civil wars, political coups, conquest, slavery, mutilations, and genocide (through cannibalism and human sacrifices). I think the Associated Press should label their article as fake news or rename it as the "Top 5 atrocities NOT committed by Christopher Columbus" instead.

#### **FN 14: ARTICLES CONNECTING COLUMBUS DAY WITH CATHOLICS**

***COLUMBUS DAY: 1892, Not 1492: Jack Schneider:***

[https://www.holycross.edu/sites/default/files/educ/columbus\\_chapter.pdf](https://www.holycross.edu/sites/default/files/educ/columbus_chapter.pdf)

***Discovery this: Columbus isn't about Columbus, Sam Wineburg, L.A. Times, October 10, 2005)***

[https://www.latimes.com/archives/la-xpm-2005-oct-10-oe-wineburg10-story.html?\\_amp=true](https://www.latimes.com/archives/la-xpm-2005-oct-10-oe-wineburg10-story.html?_amp=true)

***How Columbus Day Actually Became a Holiday, Miranda Ashton, October 12, 2015***

<https://maphappy.org/2015/10/how-columbus-day-actually-became-a-holiday/>